A Historical Perspective on Global Energy Transitions

"Modeling the Oil Transition" Washington DC April 20-21, 2006



Arnulf Grubler Yale FES and IIASA



Energy Transitions

- Change in one state of an energy system to another one, in terms of:
 - -- Quantity
 - Structure of end-use and supplyQuality
- With due regard to differences in
 -- space: "where"
 -- time: "when"

Main Energy Transitions: History

- Non-commercial \rightarrow commercial
- Renewable \rightarrow fossil
- Rural \rightarrow urban
- South \rightarrow North \rightarrow South
- Low exergy → higher exergy (H:C ratio[↑])
- Improved efficiency/productivity
- Conversion deepening (e.g. electrification)
- Increasing supply/demand density
- Desulfurization, Decarbonization

Historical Energy Transitions

World Primary Energy Demand 1800-2000 in 25 yr intervals



IND: "take-off" ~1850 "plateau" ~1975

DEV: "take-off" ~1975 "plateau" ??

Historical Energy Transitions



World Primary Energy Supply



Historical Energy Transitions

World Primary Energy Substitution



Historical Energy Transitions

Measuring US Energy Transitions

by rel. market shares (top) and absolute amounts (bottom) of primary energy use





 \star

Peak in market share precedes absolute production peak by ~60 years:

Wood 1800/1860 Feed 1860/1920 Oil 1975/??

World - Two "Grand" Transitions



Historical Energy Transitions



Historical Energy Transitions

Drivers of Historical Energy Transitions

- Technological change in end-use: steam engines, automobiles, electric motors and lights
- Supply: no evidence of resource scarcity, but plenty of evidence of TC (coal chemistry, offshore and "unconventionals", nuclear
- Price volatility (recurring): trigger of TC and structural change
- Policy: few success stories, lots of failures (Project Independence, breeders)
- Quality matters: electrification, decarbonization

Dewatering Coal Mines



A-axles, B-Wheel which is turned by treading. C-Toothed wheel, D-Drum made of rundles. E-Drum to which are fixed iron clamps. F-Second wheel. G-Balls.



Historical Energy Transitions



Technology Transitions are also Social Ones 1838: Resistance to New Technology (Railways)



Historical Energy Transitions

Technological Change in US Road Vehicles

1000 Units



Source: N. Nakicenovic, 1986.

Historical Energy Transitions

Drivers of Transitions (US cars): Continued Improvements and Complementary Infrastructures:



Cost declines of gasoline refining, T&D Source: Fisher 1974 and EIA, 1985

Cost declines of cars and increases in road infrastructures Source: Grubler, 1990.

Historical Energy Transitions



Energy Efficiency (%) and Emissions (g/km) for Horses, and Early and Contemporary Automobiles

	Horses	Cars (ca. 1920)	Cars (1995)
Engine efficiency, %	4	10	20
Wastes			
Solid	400	—	_
Liquid	200	—	_
Gaseous,			
Carbon (CO ₂) ^a	170	120	70
Carbon (CO)	-	90	2
Nitrogen (NO _x)	-	4	0.2
Hydrocarbons	2 ^{<i>b</i>}	15	0.2

a Total carbon content of fuel

b Methane

Historical Energy Transitions

Energy Quality

- Multiple dimensions:
 - -- exergy or form value
 - -- H/C ratio
 - -- emissions (particulates, sulfur)
- Few studies and largely ignored in models
- Tradeoffs between quality and price initially resolved in favor of quality (subsequent cost declines via "learning-by-doing")
- Quality trends more pronounced at end-use (supply improves only via structural change and regulation)

US - Final Energy Structure



Historical Energy Transitions

USA - Decarbonization (tC/toe)



Data Source: US DOE EIA (2001): 1960-1999; Grubler (1998): <1960.

Historical Energy Transitions

On Hubbert Curves

- Sparse historical evidence (whale oil)
- Assumed symmetry condition neither empirically or theoretically confirmed
- Continued uncertainty: "Ultimately recoverable reserves" change with exploration and new technologies
- Interaction (market response, i.e. demand & substitution) ignored or underestimated
- Economic implications of "peaking" not rigorously argued or tested

Whale Catch and Whale Oil Prices

Introduction of kerosene refining and kerosene lamps





Source: Sperm catch: P. Best, 2002, IWC SC/56/IA5; Prices: U. Bardi, 2004, based on Starbuck, 1878.

Historical Energy Transitions



An Early "Hubbert Peak"

"...the data at hand in regard to the gas still available underground ... make it probable that the annual output will never be very much more than it was during the period 1916 - 1920."

R.S. McBride and E.G. Sievers (USGS),

Mineral Resources of the United States, 1921, p.340.

US gas production: 22 Mtoe in 1920 100 Mtoe in 1995

Historical Energy Transitions

Recurring Perceptions of Geological and Environmental Limits

- 1865: W.S. Jevons The Coal Question
- 1884: J. Ruskin Storm Cloud of the 19th Century
- 1919-22: Oil rationing and scarcity fears in US
- 1970s: Limits to Growth and "energy gap" studies
- 1980s: First globally balanced supply-demand *Energy in a Finite World (1981)* Oil price collapse and expansion of non-OPEC production (>1986)
- 1990s: Interest shifts to climate change

Historical Energy Transitions

Energy in a Finite World (Haefele et al., 1981): Conventional Wisdom of the 70s (rapid demand growth, supply peak in 1990s) New Information: Uncertainty of reserves and importance of unconventional oil



Historical Energy Transitions

North America: Estimated Maximum Oil Production (all sources) EiFW, 1981 and actual



Historical Energy Transitions

Resource Constraints Beyond Energy: Estimated Water Use for Synfuel Production.

Source: EiFW, 1981.



Historical Energy Transitions



OIL: How Much Did We Know? Density of Exploratory Drilling per (potentially petroleum bearing) Sedimentary Area

Source: Grossling, 1976.



Historical Energy Transitions

OIL: Where Did We Look?

Prospective Sedimentary Areas and Oil Drilling Densities as per 1975 and per 2003

Almost inverse relation between potentials and drilling efforts!



Wells drilled through 1975 shown in black. Wells drilled 1976 through 2003 shown in red. Each circle represents 50,000 wells. Data through 1975 and relative petroleum prospective area from Grossling: "Window on Oil" Wells drilled 1976 through 2003 per *World Oil*, August issue 1977 through 2003. From the 1.9 million wells drilled worldwide since 1975 three quarters were drilled in mature oil provinces (csp. the USA), classified in 1975 as "close to drilling saturation". Update courtesy of Jeff Possick, Yale FES, 2004

Lessons Learned (even if sometimes forgotten)

- Resource availability is dynamic, "constructed" by changing economics, technology, and geological knowledge
- Feedbacks and responses often more dynamic than brains or models expect
- Constraints beyond geology important: R&D, capital, environment
- Drivers of Transition: Importance of technological change, esp. in end-use (weak point in scenarios and models of future transitions)
- Analysis needs to consider all factors
- Geological depletion and "mid-point" studies that ignore(d) potential of alternatives, economics, technology, and behavioral and market responses were both historically wrong and offered bad policy advice (Project Independence, Synfuels Corporation,...)

Historical Energy Transitions